Online appendices to:

Skating on Thin Evidence: Implications for Public Policy

Hristos Doucouliagos, Martin Paldam, and T.D. Stanley

Appendix A

List of Articles with Included Meta-analyses

Some studies report more than opne meta-study. The number is reported in []-brackets

Abdullah, A.J., Doucouliagos, C.(H.)., Manning, L. 2015. Does education reduce inequality? A meta-regression analysis. Journal of Economic Surveys, 29 (2), 301-316

Abreu, M., de Groot, H.L.F., Florax, R.J.G.M. 2005. A meta-analysis of β-convergence: The legendary 2%. Journal of Economic Surveys, 19 (3), 389-420

Adam, A., Kammas, P., Lagou, A. 2013. The effect of globalization on capital taxation: What have we learned after 20 years of empirical studies? Journal of Macroeconomics, 35, 199-209

Afesorgbor, S.K. 2013. Revisiting the effectiveness of African economic integration: A meta-analytic review and comparative estimation methods. Aarhus University, Department of Economics and Business Working Paper 2013-13

Ahmadov, A.K. 2014. Oil, democracy, and context: A meta-analysis', Comparative Political Studies, 47 (9), 1238-1267

Akgunduz, Y.E., Plantenga, J. 2011. Child care prices and female labour force participation: a meta-analysis. Tjalling C. Koopmans Research Institute, Discussion Paper Series 11-08

Allouche, J., Laroche, P. 2005. A meta-analytical investigation of the relationship between corporate social and financial performance. Revue de Gestion des Ressources Humaines, 57, 18

[3] Arnold, M.M., Rathgeber, A.W., Stöckl, S. 2014. Determinants of corporate hedging: A (statistical) meta-analysis. The Quarterly Review of Economics and Finance, 54 (4), 443-458

Asenso-Boadi, F., Peters, T.J., Coast, J. 2008. Exploring differences in empirical time preference rates for health: An application of meta-regression. Health Economics, 17 (2), 235-248

Auspurg, K., Schneck, A. 2014. What difference makes a difference? A meta-regression approach on the effectiveness conditions of incentives in self-administered surveys. Paper presented at the MAER-Colloquium, Athens

Babecky, J., Ramos, R., Sanromá, E. 2008. Meta-analysis on microeconomic wage flexibility (Wage Curve). Sozialer Fortschritt, 57 (10), 273-279

Bassani, D.G., Arora, P., Wazny, K., Gaffey, M.F., Lenters, L., Bhutta, Z.A. 2013. Financial incentives and coverage of child health interventions: A systematic review and meta-analysis. BMC Public Health, 13 (3), S30

Bel, G., Fageda, X., Warner, M.E. 2010. Is private production of public services cheaper than public production? A meta-regression analysis of solid waste and water services. Journal of Policy Analysis and Management, 29 (3), 553-577

Bellavance, F., Dionne, G., Lebeau, M. 2009. The value of a statistical life: A meta-analysis with a mixed effects regression model. Journal of Health Economics, 28 (2), 444-464

Bom, P.R.D., Ligthart, J.E. 2014. What have we learned from three decades of research on the productivity of public capital? Journal of Economic Surveys, 28 (5), 889-916

Bruno, R.L. and Cipollina, M. 2014. FDI impact on firm performance in enlarged Europe: Evidence from a meta-regression analysis. IZA Discussion Paper No. 8085

Cano, C.R., Carrillat, F.A., Jaramillo, F. 2004. A meta-analysis of the relationship between market orientation and business performance: Evidence from five continents. International Journal of Research in Marketing, 21 (2), 179-200

Castellacci, F., Lie, C.M. 2015. Do the effects of R&D tax credits vary across industries? A meta-regression analysis. Research Policy, 44 (4), 819-832

Cerasoli, C. P., Nicklin, J. M. (2014). Intrinsic motivation and extrinsic incentives jointly predict performance: A 40-year meta-analysis. Psychological Bulletin, 140, 980-1008

Chetty, R., Guren, A., Manoli, D.S. and Weber, A. 2011. Does indivisible labor explain the difference between micro and macro elasticities? A meta-analysis of extensive margin elasticities. NBER Working Paper No. 16729

Chletsos, M., Giotis, G.P. 2015. The employment effect of minimum wage using 77 international studies since 1992: A meta-analysis, MPRA Paper 61321, University Library of Munich, Germany

[6] Chliova, M., Brinckmann, J., Rosenbusch, N. 2014. Is microcredit a blessing for the poor? A meta-analysis examining development outcomes and contextual considerations. Journal of Business Venturing, 30 (3), 467-487

Clar, M., Dreger, C., Ramos, R. 2007. Wage flexibility and labour market institutions: A meta-analysis. Kyklos, 60(2), 145-163

de Dominicis, L., Florax, R.J.G.M., de Groot, H.L.F. 2008. A meta-analysis of the relationship between income inequality and economic growth. Scottish Journal of Political Economy, 55 (5), 654-682

de Linde Leonard, M. and Stanley, T.D. 2015. Married with children: What remains when observable biases are removed from the reported male marriage wage premium. Labour Economics, 33, 72-80

de Linde Leonard, M., Stanley, T.D. and Doucouliagos, H. 2014. Does the UK minimum wage reduce employment? British Journal of Industrial Relations, 52 (3), 499-520.

[6] Doucouliagos, C.(H.) 1995. Worker participation and productivity in labor-managed and participatory capitalist firms: A meta-analysis. Industrial and Labor Relations Review, 49 (1), 58-77

[5] Doucouliagos, C., Freeman, R., Laroche, P. 2016. The Economics of Trade Unions: A Study of a Research Field and its Findings, Oxford: Routledge.

Doucouliagos, C.(H.), Haman, J., Stanley, T.D. 2012. Pay for performance and corporate governance reform. Industrial Relations: A Journal of Economy and Society, 51 (3), 670-703

Doucouliagos, H., Kruse, D., Laroche, P., Stanley, T.D. 2017. Profit Sharing. Manuscript, December 2017

[2] Doucouliagos, C.(H.)., Paldam, M. 2006. Aid effectiveness on accumulation: A meta study. Kyklos, 59 (2), 227-254

Doucouliagos, C.(H.)., Paldam, M. 2013. The robust result in meta-analysis of aid effectiveness: A response to Mekasha and Tarp. Journal of Development Studies, 49 (4), 584-587

Doucouliagos, H., Paldam, M., Askarov, Z. 2017. Development aid, ideological conflict, and good political behaviour. Manuscript, August 2017

Efendic A., Pugh, G., Adnett, N. 2011. Institutions and economic performance: A meta-regression analysis. European Journal of Political Economy, 27 (3), 586-599

Escobar, M.A.C., Veerman, J.L., Tollman, S.M., Bertram, M.Y., Hofman, K.J. 2013. Evidence that a tax on sugar sweetened beverages reduces the obesity rate: A meta-analysis. BMC Public Health, 13, 1072

Fleury, N., Gilles, F. 2015. A meta-regression analysis on intergenerational transmission of education: publication bias and genuine empirical effect. TEPP Working Paper, No. 15-2

Gallet, C.A., Doucouliagos, C.(H.) 2014. The income elasticity of air travel: A meta-analysis. Annals of Tourism Research, 49, 141-155

Gallet, C.A., Doucouliagos, C.(H.) 2017. The impact of healthcare spending on health outcomes: A meta-analysis. Social Science and Medicine, 179, 9-17

Garc´ıa-Meca, E., Sa´nchez-Ballesta, J.P. 2006. Influences on financial analyst forecast errors: A meta-analysis. International Business Review, 15 (1), 29–52

Görg, H., Strobl, E. 2001. Multinational companies and productivity spillovers: A meta-analysis. The Economic Journal, 111(475), F723-739

Havránek, T. 2010. Rose effect and the Euro: Is the magic gone? Review of World Economics, 146 (2), 241-261

Havránek, T. 2015. Measuring intertemporal substitution: the importance of method choices and selective reporting. Journal of the European Economic Association, 13 (6), 1180-1204

Havránek, T., Irsova, Z. 2011. Estimating vertical spillovers from FDI: Why results vary and what the true effect is. Journal of International Economics, 85 (2), 234-244

Havránek, T., Irsova, Z. 2015. Do borders really slash trade? A meta-analysis. William Davidson Institute Working Paper No. 1088, University of Michigan

Havránek, T., Irsova, Z., Janda, K. 2012. Demand for gasoline is more price-inelastic than commonly thought. Energy Economics, 34 (1), 201-207

Havránek, T., Kokes, O. 2015. Income elasticity of gasoline demand: A meta-analysis. Energy Economics, 47, 77-86

Havránek, T., Rusnak, M., Sokolova, A.V. 2015. Habit formation in consumption: a meta-analysis. Czech National Bank and Charles University, Prague.

Havranek, T., Herman, D., and Irsova, Z., 2018. Does Daylight Saving Save Electricity? A Meta-Analysis. Energy Journal 39 (2), 35-61

Havranek, T., Irsova, Z., and Vlach, T. 2017. Measuring the Income Elasticity of Water Demand: The Importance of Publication and Endogeneity Biases. IES Working Paper 2/2017, Charles University, Prague.

Hay, D. 2014. Meta-regression in auditing research: evaluating the evidence on the big firm premium. University of Auckland - Business School manuscript.

Headey, D.D., Hodge, A. 2009. The effect of population growth on economic growth: A meta-regression analysis of the macroeconomic literature. Population and Development Review, 35 (2), 221-248.

Hsieh, C-C., Pugh, M.D. 1993. Poverty, income inequality, and violent crime: a meta-analysis of recent aggregate data studies. Criminal Justice Review, 18 (2), 182-202

Iwasaki, I., Tokunaga, M. 2014. Macroeconomic impacts of FDI in transition economies: A meta-analysis. World Development, 61, 53-69

Kim, J., Doucouliagos, H., Stanley, T.D. 2014. Market efficiency in Asian and Australasian stock markets: A fresh look at the evidence. Deakin University Economics Working Paper, 2014/9

Koetse, M.J., de Groot, H.L.F., Florax, R.J.G.M. 2006. The impact of uncertainty on investment: a meta-analysis. Tinbergen Institute Discussion Paper TI 2006-060/3

Koetse, M.J., de Groot, H.L.F., Florax, R.J.G.M. 2008. Capital-energy substitution and shifts in factor demand: A meta-analysis. Energy Economics, 30 (5), 2236-2251

Ari Kokko, Patrik Gustavsson Tingvall, and Josefin Videnord The Growth Effects of R&D Spending in the EU: A Meta-Analysis (Published in Special Issue Meta-Analysis in Theory and Practice) http://www.economics-ejournal.org/economics/journalarticles/2015-40/#ejournal-abstract

Krassoi-Peach, E., Stanley, T.D. 2009. Efficiency wages, productivity and simultaneity: A meta-regression analysis. Journal of Labor Research, 30, 262-268

Larkin, M., Doucouliagos, H. et al. House Prices and Immigration. Manuscript. August 2017

Laroche P. 2016. A meta-analysis of the union-job satisfaction relationship. British Journal of Industrial Relations, doi: 10.1111/bjir.12193

Lawry, S., Samii, C., Hall, R., Leopold, A., Hornby, D., Mtero, F. 2014. The impact of land property rights interventions on investment and agricultural productivity in developing countries: A systematic review. Campbell Systematic Reviews, 2014:1 DOI: 10.4073/csr.2014.1

Lazzaroni, S., van Bergeijk, P.A.G. 2014. Natural disasters' impact, factors of resilience and development: A meta-analysis of the macroeconomic literature. Ecological Economics, 107, 333-346

[2] Longhi, S., Nijkamp, P., Poot, J. 2010. Joint impacts of immigration on wages and employment: Review and meta-analysis. Journal of Geographical Systems, 12 (4), 355-387

[3] Ludvigsen, S. 2009. Post-mortem of the VP function? Meta-regression analyses of economic voting in the United Kingdom. PhD Dissertation, Department of Political Science, Aarhus University

Lye, J., Hirschberg, J. 2010. Alcohol consumption and human capital: A retrospective study of the literature. Journal of Economic Surveys, 2 (4), 309-338

Maidment, C.D., Jones, C.R., Webb, T.L., Hathway, A.E., Gilbertson, J.M. 2014. The impact of household energy efficiency measures on health: A meta-analysis. Energy Policy, 65, 583-593

Moons, S., van Bergeijk, P.A.G. 2013. A meta-analysis of economic diplomacy and its effect on international economic flows. ISS Working Papers, General Series, No. 566, The Hague: International Institute of Social Studies

Nataraj, S., Perez-Arce, F., Kumar, K.B. 2014. The impact of labor market regulation on employment in low-income countries: A meta-analysis. Journal of Economic Surveys, 28 (3), 551-572

[2] Nelson, J.P. 2011. Alcohol marketing, adolescent drinking and publication bias in longitudinal studies: A critical survey using meta-analysis. Journal of Economic Surveys, 25 (2), 191-232

Nijkamp, P., Poot, J. 2005. The last word on the wage curve. Journal of Economic Surveys, 19 (3), 421-450

Pomeroy, B., Thornton, D.B. 2008. Meta-analysis and the accounting literature: the case of audit committee independence and financial reporting quality. European Accounting Review, 17 (2), 305-330

Rhoades, D.L., Rechner, P.L., Sundaramurthy, C. 2001. A meta-analysis of board leadership structure and financial performance: Are “two heads better than one”? Corporate Governance, 9 (4), 311-319

Rosenbusch, N., Brinckmann, J., Bausch, A. 2011. Is innovation always beneficial? A meta-analysis of the relationship between innovation and performance in SMEs. Journal of Business Venturing, 26 (4), 441-457

Rusnak, M., Havránek, T., Horvath, R. 2013. How to solve the price puzzle? A meta-analysis. Journal of Money, Credit and Banking, 45 (1), 37-70

Santeramo, F.G., Shabnam, N. 2015. The income-elasticity of calories, macro- and micro-nutrients: what is the literature telling us? Food Research International, 764), 932-937

Shen, Y-C., Eggleston, K., Lau, J., Schmid, C.H. 2007. Hospital ownership and financial performance: What explains the different findings in the empirical literature? Inquiry, 44 (1), 41-68

Stanley, T.D., Doucouliagos, C., Steel, P. 2018. Does ICT generate economic growth? A meta-regression analysis, Journal of Economic Surveys, forthcoming

Valickova, P., Havránek, T., Horvath, R. 2015. Financial development and economic growth: A meta-analysis. Journal of Economic Surveys, 29 (3), 506-526

Wagner III, J.A., Stimpert, J.L., Fubara, E.I. 1998. Board composition and organization performance: Two studies of insider/outsider effects. Journal of Management Studies, 35 (5), 655-677

Yang, M., Stanley, T.D. 2012. Micro-credit and income: A literature review and meta-analysis. Bulletin of Economics and Meta-Analysis. https://www.hendrix.edu/maer-network/default.aspx?id=15206. Accessed August 6th, 2015

Yerrabati, S., Hawkes, D.D. 2016. Institutions and Investment in the South and East Asia and Pacific Region: Evidence from Meta-Analysis (Published in Special Issue Meta-Analysis in Theory and Practice) http://www.economics-ejournal.org/economics/journalarticles/2016-11

Appendix B

Table 1B. Median SMAPE in percent for k = 5, 10, and 20

Estimator	Estimates of true effect: (1) *WLS*	(2) *PET-PEESE*	(3) *WAAP*	(4) *WAAP-WLS*
Part A. Results for k = 5				
(1) Mean	90	136	109	112
(2) Median	78	135	86	108
(3) Paldam	71	115	79	87
(4) *WLS*	66	124	79	98
(5) *PET-PEESE*	132	140	109	138
(6) *WAAP-WLS*	80	129	89	92
Median for true effects	79	132	87	103
Part B. Results for k = 10				
(1) Mean	80	117	95	103
(2) Median	69	124	77	102
(3) Paldam	64	106	73	76
(4) *WLS*	57	99	58	70
(5) *PET-PEESE*	113	106	109	118
(6) *WAAP-WLS*	72	105	67	74
Median for true effects	70	106	75	89
Part C. Results for k = 20				
(1) Mean	80	116	95	103
(2) Median	67	120	83	95
(3) Paldam	61	99	69	74
(4) *WLS*	50	80	61	63
(5) *PET-PEESE*	101	91	96	101
(6) *WAAP-WLS*	63	92	63	65
Median for true effects	65	96	76	84

Source: k denotes the number of studies. Bold highlights lowest SMAPE.

Table 2B. Summary of MAPE and SMAPE medians reported as a percent, for the 9 meta-studies with k ≥ 80

		(1)	(2)	(3)	Median of
Number of studies, *k*		5	10	20	Medians
	Part A: Summary of median MAPE for each estimator				
(1)	Mean	194	165	156	165
(2)	Median	346	260	226	260
(3)	Paldam	74	73	69	73
(4)	*WLS*	276	179	156	179
(5)	*PET-PEESE*	373	341	248	341
(6)	*WAAP-WLS*	276	192	173	192
	Part B. Summary of median SMAPE for each estimator				
(1)	Mean	95	99	84	95
(2)	Median	124	99	91	99
(3)	Paldam	74	96	91	91
(4)	*WLS*	113	87	81	87
(5)	*PET-PEESE*	154	163	122	154
(6)	*WAAP-WLS*	113	92	88	92

Table 3B. Summary of MAPE and SMAPE medians reported as a percent, for the 41 meta-studies with k ≥ 40

		(1)	(2)	(3)	Median of
Number of studies, *k*		5	10	20	Medians
	Part A: Summary of median MAPE for each estimator				
(1)	Mean	285	271	271	271
(2)	Median	331	257	209	257
(3)	Paldam	99	102	101	101
(4)	*WLS*	153	109	117	117
(5)	*PET-PEESE*	159	174	153	159
(6)	*WAAP-WLS*	91	96	77	91
	Part B. Summary of median SMAPE for each estimator				
(1)	Mean	118	118	117	118
(2)	Median	126	105	98	105
(3)	Paldam	101	96	87	96
(4)	*WLS*	118	81	79	81
(5)	*PET-PEESE*	136	122	111	122
(6)	*WAAP-WLS*	118	93	88	93